PENNSYLVANIA ORNITHOLOGICAL RECORDS COMMITTEE 210 Welcome Ave. Norwood, PA 19074

12 February 2002

Randy C. Miller 607 Woodland Drive Manheim, PA 17545-9553

Dear Randy,

Thank you for submitting documentation of the Thayer's Gulls at Memorial Lake State Park on December 24 and 26, 1997, and the Northern Wheatear there on October 19, 1998. After careful review, the Committee regrets that it has voted not to accept these records.

Thayer's Gulls: Members' opinions were divided, and the balloting went two rounds (which partly explains the delay in announcing our decision). The final vote was five votes in favor of acceptance and two not in favor -- one vote short of the 6-1 decision which our bylaws require for acceptance.

One dissenting member felt that the birds were quite likely Thayer's but was concerned that a Thayer's/Iceland intergrade was not eliminated conclusively. The other felt that there was not quite enough detail to be sure about bird #1. About bird #2 he was troubled by the pinkish base to the bill, commenting "I think it is really too early for a 1st-winter to have this."

Northern Wheatear: Balloting went two rounds on this record as well, with a final vote wof four members favoring acceptance and three not in favor.

The outcome placed the record in PORC's Class IV-A: "a record for which there exists a majority of evidence in support of an observer's identification; the record is probably correct, but not beyond reasonable doubt."

The three dissenting members expressed one or both of two concerns: There was no mention in the description of whether the inverted T on a Northern Wheatear's tail was seen. The (indeed very remote!) possibility of an Isabelline Wheatear from the Old World was not eliminated, as it was for a bird seen earlier in October in Juniata County.

Non-acceptance certainly does not imply that these birds were not identified correctly, but rather that too few members felt they could accept the records with certainty. We hope this does not discourage you from submitting reports of rarities in the future.

Sincerely,

For the Committee: Paul Hess, Chairman

Record #348-03-1997, 348-04-1997 (Thayer's Gulls); 646-02-1997 (Northern Wheatear)

SIGHTING DATE: 19 Oct. 1997 SIGHTING TIME: 8am - 9:15am LOCATION: COUNTY & STATE: Lebanon Co., Penna. DISTANCE & DIRECTION FROM NEAREST TOWN: 6 miles north on TRA 934 from Anoville, Pace DIRECTIONS, IF APPLICABLE: Memorial Lake State Park HABITAT. On dam breast with large rocks with Some Small shrubs. Apr 200 yards lang. SIGHTING: DISTANCE: 60 yards to 1004 yards EQUIP. USED: 15375 Gusneril and 10750 Switts. EUNGTH OF SIGHTING: 1st sighting was apr. 30 seconds, brief sightings in thight. DESCRIPTION: VOICE: not heard SIZE: opx 6" PLUMAGE: Connews breast, med. Sowen and and top si read; both supercil dark mask, dark eye compile that black bill, dark crown wings with no viring both, Lump and top si that, while, lower holf of tail dark brown. ANATOMY (bill length, leg color, etc.): Deck legs, short this dock bill, protocomers and post on the dark bill protocomers. FAMILIARITY WITH THIS & SIMILAR SPECIES; I have seen. National without a large with read applied that large read applied that large with read applied that large read applied that		Imph						
SIGHTING DATE: 19 Oct. 1997 LOCATION: COUNTY & STATE: Lebanon Co., Penna. DISTANCE & DIRECTION FROM NEAREST TOWN: 6 miles morth on TR. 934 from Annuille, Pa. DIRECTIONS, IF APPLICABLE: Memorial Lake State Park HABITAT: On dam breast with large rocks with some Small chrubs. Apr 200 yards long. SIGHTING: Partly alough your yords. LIGHTING: Partly alough your yords. EQUIP USED! ISSN'S Guenari and 10x50 swiths. LENGTH OF SIGHTING: 1st sighting was apr. 30 accounts, brief sightings in flight. DESCRIPTION: VOICE: not heard SIZE: opx 6" PLUMAGE: Cinnam an breast, mrd. brown and dap of read, buff supercil dark mask dark yet pen of the fitting hack crown wings with no wing acts, rump and the fitting was apr. 30 accounts, brief sightings are fitting acts, rump and the fitting was apr. 30 accounts, brief sightings with no wing acts, rump and the fitting was apr. 30 accounts, brief sightings with make the fitting acts, rump and the fitting was apr. 30 accounts, brief sightings with make the state of the fitting acts, rump and the fitting of the fitting on the sightings with a lack bill, produce registings and the lack bill, produce registings with a lack bill, produce registings with a fitting and with a lack bill, produce registings with a lack bill produce registings and the lack registings and the lack registings and the lack registings and produce registings with a lack bill produce registings and produce registers. FAMILIARITY WITH THIS & SIMILAR SPECIES, I have seen Notions wherefore any produce registers are registers and produce registers and produce registers and produce registers and pro	SPECIES: Norther	wheatear "Footen"	NUMBER SEEN:					
DISTANCE & DIRECTION FROM NEAREST TOWN: 6 miles north on 724.934 from Annylle, Pack DIRECTIONS, IF APPLICABLE: Memorial Lake State Pack HABITAT: On dam breast with large rocks with Some Small shrubs. Apr 200 yards lang. SIGHTING: LIGHTING: Partly sloudy DISTANCE 60 yards to Joo 4 yards EQUIP. USED: 157845 sustment and 10x50 swiths. EUNGTH OF SIGHTING: 1st sighting was apr 30 seconds, brief sightings in flight. DESCRIPTION: VICE: not heard SIZE: apx 6" PLUMAGE: Cinnaman breast, med, became and top of read, both supercil dark mask, dark eye small thin block will, dark crown wings with mask wing bars, rome and top at tail white, lower half of tail dark brown. BELLY light both white widerful costs. ANATOMY (bill length, leg color, etc.): Dark legs, short thin clock bill, med an ontop of a post on the down breast. Then it flow out of sinht. The only other sightings were of the bird cring chased by Am. Rooms. FAMILIARITY WITH THIS & SIMILAR SPECIES; I have seen Nothern Wireston and your and with a large with a large with the first cighting of the Eastern race. COMPARISON TO SIMILAR SPECIES. About know of another small through sind with a large with a large with the first trick. HAS A PHOTOGRAPH BEEN TAKEN? no IF SO, BY WHO? Have any additional observers filled out a rare species report? If so, who? ADDITIONAL COMMENTS (Use back of form for more space): SIGHTING & REPORT BY: Roady C. Miller ADDRESS: 607 Woodland Dr. PHONE # (717) 664-3778 Hauheim Te 17545			SIGHTING TIME: 8am - 9:15am					
SIGHTING SIGHTING: Partly slowdy DISTANCE: 60 years to 1000 yeards EQUIP. USED: 155-45 Governer! and 1005 Switts. LENGTH OF SIGHTING: 1st sighting was apo. 30 seconds, brief sightings in flight. DESCRIPTION: VOICE: not heard SIZE: opx 6" PLUMAGE: Cinnaman breath, med, become and top of read, but superceil dark mask, dark eye, comoil their black bill, dark crown wings with no wing bars, runn and thou that white, lower half of teal dork crown. Belly light but, White underton counts. ANATOMY (bill length, leg color, etc.): Dark legs, short thin clack bill, medus restarting BEHAVIOR: I first saw this bird citing on top of a post on the down breast. Then it flew out of estima. BEHAVIOR: I first saw this bird citing on top of a post on the down breast. Then it flew out of estima. FAMILIARITY WITH THIS & SIMILAR SPECIES: I have seen Notices Wireafter only in Alaska. This was my first sighting of the "Eastern" race. COMPARISON TO SIMILAR SPECIES: I don't know of another small terush shoped cited with a large with runn and upper term. HAS A PHOTOGRAPH BEEN TAKEN? no IF SO, BY WHO? Have any additional observers filled out a rare species report? If so, who? ADDITIONAL COMMENTS (Use back of form for more space): SIGHTING & REPORT BY: Randy C. Miller ADDRESS: 607 Woodland Dr. PHONE # (717) 664-3778 **Manheim Pa 17545**		DISTANCE & DIRECTION FR 6 miles north on 12t. 934 DIRECTIONS, IF APPLICABL	E: Memorial Lake State Park					
SIGHTING CONDITIONS: LIGHTING: Partly sloudy pool yards EQUIP. USED: Issels: Everneil and 12x50 swifts. EQUIP. USED: Issels: Everneil and 12x50 swifts. LENGTH OF SIGHTING: 1st sighting was apo. 30 seconds, brief sightings in flight. DESCRIPTION: VOICE: not heard SIZE: 0px 6" PLUMAGE: Common breast, med. brown case and top of read, buff supercil dark mask, dark eye, small thin black bill, dark crown wings with no wing ears, sumple and top of tail, white, lower half of tail dark crown. Bethy light bethy white underton coarts. ANATOMY (bill length, leg color, etc.): Derk legs, short thin clack bill, med an expertion BEHAVIOR: I first saw this bird estima on top of a post on the dam breast. Then it flew out of sight. The only other cightings were of the bird ceing chased by Am. Robins. FAMILIARITY WITH THIS & SIMILAR SPECIES: I have seen Notices where dightings were of the bird ceing chased by Am. Robins. COMPARISON TO SIMILAR SPECIES: don't know at another small thrush shaped cird with a large white room, and upper tail. HAS A PHOTOGRAPH BEEN TAKEN? No IF SO, BY WHO? Have any additional observers filled out a rare species report? If so, who? ADDITIONAL COMMENTS (Use back of form for more space): SIGHTING & REPORT BY: Randy C. Miller ADDRESS: bot Woodland Dr. PHONE # (717) 664-3778 Hanheim Pa 17545	HABITAT: On da	m breast with large rock po yards long.	s with some small shrubs.					
PLUMAGE: Cinnaman breast, med. brown caco and top of read, buff supercil dark mask, dark eye, cmall thin black cill, dark crown wings with no wing bars, rump and top of tail white, lower half of tail dark brown. Belly light buff, white undertail consists. ANATOMY (bill length, leg color, etc.): Derk legs, short thin clack bill, media in standard a post on the dam breast. Then it flew out of cight. The only other sightings were of the bird being chased by Am. Pooling. FAMILIARITY WITH THIS & SIMILAR SPECIES; I have seen Not here in wheater only in Alaska. This was my first cighting of the Eastern race. COMPARISON TO SIMILAR SPECIES; I don't know of another small thrush shaped cird with a large write rum, and upper test. HAS A PHOTOGRAPH BEEN TAKEN? no IF SO, BY WHO? Have any additional observers filled out a rare species report? If so, who? ADDITIONAL COMMENTS (Use back of form for more space): SIGHTING & REPORT BY: Randy C. Miller ADDRESS: 607 Woodland Dr. PHONE # (717) 664-3778 Manheim Pa 17545	SIGHTING	LENGTH OF SIGHTING: (2) sighting was apx. 30 seconds, site sightings						
PLUMAGE: Cinnamon breast, med. brown cach and top of read, boff supercil dark mask, dark eye, small thin black bill, dark crown wings with no wing bars, rump and top of tail white, lower half of tail dark crown. Belly light boff, white undertail quests. ANATOMY (bill length, leg color, etc.): Deck legs, short thin clack bill, median crost tail. BEHAVIOR: I first saw this bird sitting on top of a post on the dam breast. Then it flew out of cinnt. The only other sightings were of the bird being chased by Am. Robins. FAMILIARITY WITH THIS & SIMILAR SPECIES: I have seen Noticen wheater only in Alaska. This was my first sighting of the "Eastern" race. COMPARISON TO SIMILAR SPECIES: It don't know of another small thrush snopred cired with a large write rump and upper text. HAS A PHOTOGRAPH BEEN TAKEN? no IF SO, BY WHO? Have any additional observers filled out a rare species report? If so, who? ADDITIONAL COMMENTS (Use back of form for more space): SIGHTING & REPORT BY: Randy C. Miller ADDRESS: 607 Woodland Dr. PHONE # (717) 664-3778 Manheim Pa 17545	DESCRIPTION:	V						
dark mask, dark eye, small thin black cill, dark crown wings with no wing bars, rump and the of tail white, lower half of tail dark crown. Belly light both White undertail exerts. ANATOMY (bill length, leg color, etc.): Derk legs, short thin clack bill, median cratical. BEHAVIOR: I First saw this bird citing on top of a post on the down breast. Then it flew out of sight. The only other sightings were of the bird ceina chased by Am. Robins. FAMILIARITY WITH THIS & SIMILAR SPECIES: I have seen Notifier Wheater only in Alaska. This was my first eighting of the Eastern race. COMPARISON TO SIMILAR SPECIES: I don't know of another small thrush shaped cird with a large write rum, and upper tail. HAS A PHOTOGRAPH BEEN TAKEN? No IF SO, BY WHO? Have any additional observers filled out a rare species report? If so, who? ADDITIONAL COMMENTS (Use back of form for more space): SIGHTING & REPORT BY: Randy C. Miller ADDRESS: 607 Woodland Dr. PHONE # (717) 664-3778 Manheim Ta 17545								
FAMILIARITY WITH THIS & SIMILAR SPECIES: I have seen Notinern Wheater only in Alaska. This was my first sighting of the "Eastern race. COMPARISON TO SIMILAR SPECIES: It don't know of another small torush shaped circle with a large write room, and upper tent. HAS A PHOTOGRAPH BEEN TAKEN? no IF SO, BY WHO? Have any additional observers filled out a rare species report? If so, who? ADDITIONAL COMMENTS (Use back of form for more space): SIGHTING & REPORT BY: Randy C. Miller ADDRESS: 607 Woodland Dr. PHONE # (717) 664-3778 Manheim Ra 17545		dark mask, dark eye, small thin black oil, dark brown wings with no wing bars, rump and top of tail white, lower half of tail dark brown. Belly light buff. White undertail coverts. ANATOMY (bill length, leg color, etc.):						
COMPARISON TO SIMILAR SPECIES: It don't know of another small torush snoped circle with a large write room, and appear tail. HAS A PHOTOGRAPH BEEN TAKEN? No IF SO, BY WHO? Have any additional observers filled out a rare species report? If so, who? ADDITIONAL COMMENTS (Use back of form for more space): SIGHTING & REPORT BY: Randy C. Miller ADDRESS: 607 Woodland Dr. PHONE # (717) 664-3778 Manheim To 17545		BEHAVIOR: I first saw the the dam breast. Then it flewere of the bird being chas	is bird sitting on top of a post on it would sight. The only other sightings ed by Am. Robins.					
HAS A PHOTOGRAPH BEEN TAKEN? NO IF SO, BY WHO? Have any additional observers filled out a rare species report? If so, who? ADDITIONAL COMMENTS (Use back of form for more space): SIGHTING & REPORT BY: Randy C. Miller ADDRESS: 607 Woodland Dr. PHONE # (717) 664-3778 Manheim Ra 17545	in Alaska. "Thi	is was my tirst sighting o	The tasien race.					
Have any additional observers filled out a rare species report? If so, who? ADDITIONAL COMMENTS (Use back of form for more space): SIGHTING & REPORT BY: Randy C. Miller ADDRESS: 607 Woodland Dr. PHONE # (717) 664-3778 Manheim Ra 17545	COMPARISON TO	SIMILAR SPECIES: It don't h	show of another small thrush shaped cird					
ADDITIONAL COMMENTS (Use back of form for more space): SIGHTING & REPORT BY: Randy C. Miller ADDRESS: 607 Woodland Dr. PHONE # (717) 664-3778 Manheim Fa 17545	HAS A PHOTOGR	APH BEEN TAKEN? No	IF SO, BY WHO?					
SIGHTING & REPORT BY: Randy C. Miller ADDRESS: 607 Woodland Dr. PHONE # (717) 664-3778 Manheim Fa 17545	Have any addition	al observers filled out a rare sp	ecies report? If so, who?					
ADDRESS: 607 Woodland Dr. PHONE # (717) 664-3778 Manheim Fa 17545	ADDITIONAL CO	MMENTS (Use back of form fo	r more space):					
ADDRESS: 607 Woodland Dr. PHONE # (717) 664-3778 Manheim Fa 17545	SIGHTING & REP	ORT BY: Randy C. Miller						
Manheim Pa 17545			PHONE # (717) 664-3778					
SIGNATURE Randy C. Miller DATE: 21 Oct. 1997	. 1							
	SIGNATURE Ran	ndy C. Miller	DATE: 21 oct. 1997					

On 19 Oct. 1997 I went birding with the Lancoster Co. Bird C166 : to Memorial Lake. Rosemary Spreha lead the group of 10 people.

We birded around the dam area first. I carried by 15x45 Rushnell and 10x50 Swifts. Below the dam there were apx. 300± Am. Robins. Twice I saw a bird with white on the rump. It would fly, then land where I could not see it. Most people were watching the I Rusty Blackbirds in the creek. Then I saw the bird fly up and land on a post. It was apx. 60 yards away. I put my scope on it and saw it was a Northern Wheatear. After 30 sec. it flew to the top of the dam breast. The white rump + top of the tail where highly visible. The group guickly went to the top of the dam breast. We sighted the bird 5-6 more times around the rocks, always being chased by Am. Robins. It would fly 20 to 100 yards, then hide in the rocks. We didn't go down into the rocks because we did not want to scare the bird away. We were hoping for a better view. But at 9:15 the N. Wheatear was seen being chased by an Am. Robin south until it was out of sight.

Record No.: 646-02-1997

Pennsylvania Ornithological Records Committee Voting Tabulation - Round One

Species: Northern V	Wheatear (C	Denanthe o	enanthe)					
Date of Sighting: 19 Location: MEMOR County: LEBANON Observer(s): Randy	IAL LAKE V	998 to 19 (October 19	998				
Date of Submission: Submitted by: Rand	y Miller					2		,
INA ITTEN DESC	RIPTIAN	YES	PHOTO	onlo S	PECIMEN	No KE	wrains	No
Member	Class I	Class II	Class III	Class IV-A	Class IV-B	Class IV-C	Class V	Abst ain
D. Couchman				×				
T. Floyd								X
P. Hess				X				
R. Ickes			X	,				
J. McWilliams			X					
B. Reid			X					
P. Rodewald			X					
TOTALS			4	2				1
DECISION			4	2				/
Comments: 4/2/	1	201)	Rov	ND				

Signature (Secretary)

Record No.: 646-02-1997

Pennsylvania Ornithological Records Committee Voting Ballot - Round Two

Species: Northern Wheatear (Oenanthe oenanthe)

Date of Sighting: 19 October 1997 to 19 October 1997

Location: MEMORIAL LAKE

County: LEBANON Observer(s): Randy Miller

Date of Submission: 1997 Submitted by: Randy Miller

Written Description: Yes

Photo: No

Specimen: No

Recording: No

Member	Class I Class II	Class III	Class IV-A	Class IV-B	Class IV-C	Class V	Abstain	
D. Couchman				X				
G. Armistead			X					
P. Hess			X					
R. Ickes				X				
J. McWilliams			X					
B. Reid				X				
P. Rodewald			χ					
TOTALS			4	3				
DECISION				X				

Comments: 4/3/0 rejected

Signature (Secretary):

Date: coldilor